



PHYSICIAN PAYMENT REVIEW BOARD

Annual Report
April 1, 2014 – March 31, 2015

Address: 151 Bloor Street W.
9th Floor
Toronto, ON
M5S 1S4

Phone: 416-327-8512
Toll-Free: 1-866-282-2179
TTY: 416-326-7889
TTY Toll-Free: 1-877-301-0889



**Physician Payment Review
Board**

151 Bloor Street West, 9th floor
Toronto, Ontario M5S 1S4
Telephone 416-327-8512
Toll free 1-866-282-2179
TTY 416-326-7TTY (889)
TTY Toll free 1-877-301-0TTY (889)
Facsimile 416- 327-8524

**Commission de révision des
paiements effectués aux médecins**

151, rue Bloor ouest, 9^e étage
Toronto, Ontario M5S 1S4
Téléphone 416-327-8512
Sans frais 1-866-282-2179
ATS 416-326-7889
ATS sans frais 1-877-301-0889
Télécopieur 416- 327-8524

June 30, 2015

The Honourable Dr. Eric Hoskins
Minister of Health and Long-Term Care
Minister's Office
Hepburn Block, 10th Floor
80 Grosvenor Street
Toronto ON M7A 2C4

Dear Minister:

RE: Physician Payment Review Board

On behalf of the Physician Payment Review Board (PPRB), it is my pleasure to submit the Annual Report for the fiscal year 2014/2015.

The PPRB is committed to the initiatives outlined in the report and to ensuring excellence and transparency in the service it provides to the Ontario public.

Yours sincerely,

Ross Male, M.D., M.Sc., CCFP, FCFP
Chair
Physician Payment Review Board

cc: Sara van der Vliet
Chief Operating Officer, Health Boards Secretariat
Registrar, Physician Payment Review Board

TABLE OF CONTENTS

MESSAGE FROM THE HEALTH BOARDS SECRETARIAT	3
MESSAGE FROM THE CHAIR.....	5
MANDATE OF THE PHYSICIAN PAYMENT REVIEW BOARD.....	6
MISSION STATEMENT	6
ACHIEVEMENTS OF THE PHYSICIAN PAYMENT REVIEW BOARD.....	7
Case Management.....	7
Member Development	7
Stakeholder Outreach	7
Governance	8
PERFORMANCE OF THE PHYSICIAN PAYMENT REVIEW BOARD	9
Operational Performance.....	9
Financial Performance.....	10
PHYSICIAN PAYMENT REVIEW BOARD MEMBERSHIP.....	11
HEALTH BOARDS SECRETARIAT STAFF	13



Physician Payment Review Board

151 Bloor Street West, 9th floor
Toronto, Ontario M5S 1S4
Telephone 416-327-8512
Toll free 1-866-282-2179
TTY 416-326-7TTY (889)
TTY Toll free 1-877-301-0TTY (889)
Facsimile 416- 327-8524

Commission de révision des paiements effectués aux médecins

151, rue Bloor ouest, 9^e étage
Toronto, Ontario M5S 1S4
Téléphone 416-327-8512
Sans frais 1-866-282-2179
ATS 416-326-7889
ATS sans frais 1-877-301-0889
Télécopieur 416- 327-8524

Dr. Ross Male
Chair, Physician Payment Review Board
151 Bloor Street West, 9th Floor
Toronto ON M5S 1S4

May 30, 2015

Dear Dr. Male:

I am pleased to report to you on behalf of the Health Boards Secretariat (the "Secretariat"). The Secretariat continues to provide comprehensive administrative, corporate, fiscal and case management support to the Physician Payment Review Board ("PPRB" or "Board"). In addition, the Secretariat provides similar support functions to other adjudicative tribunals as well as payment processing functions for other health related services.

Although there were no hearings or motions conducted within the last fiscal year, Telephone Pre-Hearing Conferences continue to be held at the intake stage of the appeal process allowing the Board facilitators the opportunity to educate the parties regarding the jurisdiction of the PPRB and mediate/ discuss the issues involved in each individual matter. Communications and distribution of materials to PPRB facilitators continues to be transmitted electronically and an increasing number of parties to PPRB matters are corresponding electronically with the Board, supporting the PPRB's commitment to green and efficient operations.

The establishment of a public website in 2012 to provide the public with key information about the PPRB, its mandate, procedures and governance structure remains an invaluable tool for the public and the parties. The Board's website provides links to relevant websites so physicians may conduct an independent review into the jurisdiction of the PPRB or review outcomes of past Board proceedings.

Funding for the PPRB continues to be directed through the Health Services Branch of the Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care to the Secretariat. As in years past, there are some limitations in detailing expenditures as they relate to the specific agencies supported by the Secretariat. Expenditures such as salaries and facility costs are not included in the financial data on page 9 as many resources are shared with the Secretariat's other adjudicative tribunals and it would be arbitrary to determine what portion of cost should be attributed specifically to any one agency. These costs are, however, incorporated in the fiscal planning cycle by the Secretariat and are reported to the Ministry. The Secretariat remains committed to working collaboratively with the PPRB and its members in exercising strong controllership practices to ensure responsible expenditure while enabling access to justice.

I trust that this information is of assistance to you, and I look forward to continuing to lead services providing support to the Physician Payment Review Board.

Yours truly,



Sara van der Vliet
Chief Operating Officer, Health Boards Secretariat
Registrar, Physician Payment Review Board

MESSAGE FROM THE CHAIR

As Chair of the Physician Payment Review Board (“PPRB”) since October 6, 2014, it is my pleasure to report on the PPRB’s activity and achievements for the period of 2014/2015. The commitment of the membership of the Board combined with the ongoing contributions of the staff of the Health Boards Secretariat (the “Secretariat”) have enabled this Board to better establish its role, processes and profile in the health care and administrative justice communities.

The PPRB is mandated to conduct hearings regarding payment disputes between physicians and the General Manager of the Ontario Health Insurance Plan (“OHIP”). The role of the PPRB is not to advocate for changes to the physician billing model in Ontario, it is to adjudicate the appeals that are brought to it in accordance with the *Health Insurance Act*.

While the PPRB has received appeals from physicians since the time of its inception in 2010, no hearings were conducted in the past fiscal year as all matters initiated within the fiscal year of 2014/2015 continue to be adjudicated prior to hearing at the request, or with the consent of the parties. The PPRB anticipates that there will be an increase in the hearing of appeals and motions in the upcoming fiscal year due to the current status of those active matters currently before the Board. A large number of the requests for appeal received within the fiscal year of 2014/2015 were resolved between the parties either by way of withdrawal or settlement prior to a hearing. A small number of matters were also closed due to a lack of jurisdiction of the Board to adjudicate the matter at issue. We consider the Board’s ability to successfully resolve such a significant number of appeals, relative to Board overall intake, indicative of a comprehensive payment system that is aligned in accordance with the recommendations of the Honourable Peter Cory and designed to be educational rather than adversarial.

In line with the PPRB’s commitment to adjudicate matters fairly, openly and transparently, the decision and reasons in matters heard by the Board are available to the public on the Canadian Legal Information Institute (CanLII). CanLII is a non-profit organization managed by the Federation of Law Societies of Canada which provides Canadian legal decisions, statutes and regulations to the public for free on the internet. The PPRB has also increased outreach to the health care and administrative justice sectors through its public website which not only includes information regarding the role and mandate of the PPRB, but all documents required for compliance under the *Adjudicative Tribunals Accountability, Governance and Appointments Act*.

I am pleased to work with fellow members and staff who endeavor to provide high quality service to the public of Ontario in this important area of the health care field. I look forward to the year ahead with anticipated increased hearing activity and during which time the PPRB will continue to establish itself as an important part of an accountable and transparent physician audit framework in Ontario.



Ross Male, M.D., M.Sc., CCFP, FCFP
Chair
Physician Payment Review Board

MANDATE OF THE PHYSICIAN PAYMENT REVIEW BOARD

The Physician Payment Review Board (PPRB) is an independent adjudicative agency established in Section 5.1 of the *Health Insurance Act* (HIA). The PPRB exercises its powers and responsibilities in accordance with the HIA and Schedule 1 to the HIA, as well as under the *Statutory Powers and Procedures Act*, R.S.O. 1990 and delegated authority under the *Public Service of Ontario Act*, R.S.O. 2006.

The PPRB conducts hearings regarding payment disputes between physicians and the General Manager of OHIP (the G.M.). Where a resolution to a billing dispute between a physician and the G.M. cannot be resolved through the provision of education and other assistance, the PPRB provides an appeal process that is independent from the Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care and the Minister of Health and Long-Term Care.

MISSION STATEMENT

The Physician Payment Review Board is committed to providing the highest quality service to the public, and to being valued partners in the delivery of health care in Ontario.

ACHIEVEMENTS OF THE PHYSICIAN PAYMENT REVIEW BOARD

In 2014/2015 the Physician Payment Review Board (“PPRB”) has continued to deliver high quality service to the public of Ontario. In line with the PPRB’s mandate and its authority under the *Health Insurance Act*, the following achievements have been made:

Case Management

- The majority of appeals received by the PPRB continue to be resolved without proceeding to hearing, supporting the educational and discussion forum attributes of Pre-Hearing Conference methodology.
- Of the 53 matters received in this reporting year, more than half were resolved prior to hearing and the remaining continue to benefit from the open discussions and mediation available through Pre-Hearing Conference.
- Of the 53 new requests for appeal received this year, a majority are a result of multiple requests for appeals from a single physician relating to services provided to multiple patients. In some situations, multiple decisions were issued by the General Manager of OHIP pertaining to each individual patient, but may relate to a single appeal issue (a particular fee code, for example). In such cases, a physician may put forward multiple requests for appeal which in essence, relate to a single issue.

Member Development

- Completion of the reappointments process for members whose Order-in-Council appointments expired on April 27, 2015 was initiated early in the new Calendar year and completed in late April.
- On October 6, 2014, the PPRB convened its annual Board meeting at which members elected a new Chair and Executive Committee as well as approved the Board’s Governance Terms of Reference. In addition, members received an administrative update regarding relevant Board operations as well as continuing education content.
- The first Executive Committee meeting was conducted via teleconference on November 18, 2014 and included the PPRB Chair, three Vice-Chairs, and five additional committee members. The Executive Committee members were elected by their peers and is made up of half being physician members and half being public members. The role of Executive Committee is to assist the Chair in planning new initiatives and in communicating those initiatives to the wider membership, action urgent issues on the Chair’s behalf and provide recommendations or analysis on Board issues upon request of the Board or the Board Chair.

Stakeholder Outreach

- In July 2012 the PPRB established and made available to the public a website, www.pprb.on.ca, which includes information regarding its mandate and processes, links to relevant legislation, and access to Board accountability and governance documents.
- On January 1, 2015, the Board’s finalized Rules of Practice and Procedure were made available on the PPRB website. The previously utilized Interim Rules of Practice and Procedure remain available on the website for those matters which were initiated prior to January 1, 2015.

- In December 2014 a Notice to the Profession was placed in Ontario Reports advising of the upcoming changes to the Board's Rules of Practice and Procedure and directed interested parties to the Board's website to access the documents.

Governance

- The *Adjudicative Tribunal Accountability, Governance and Appointments Act, 2009* (ATAGAA) aims to increase efficiencies and transparency in the tribunal's operations while maintaining independence in their decision-making. In compliance with the stipulations of the *Act*, the PPRB has developed all required governance and accountability documents which are approved by the Minister and made available on the PPRB website.

PERFORMANCE OF THE PHYSICIAN PAYMENT REVIEW BOARD

Operational Performance

The PPRB is an independent adjudicative tribunal that conducts hearings and renders decisions on payment disputes that arise between Ontario physicians and the OHIP General Manager. The following information reflects the appeal activity of the PPRB since the Board was established in 2010.

Caseload Summary	Apr 1, 2010 – Mar 31, 2011	Apr 1, 2011 – Mar 31, 2012	Apr 1, 2012 – Mar 31, 2013	Apr 1, 2013 – Mar 31, 2014	Apr 1, 2014 – Mar 31, 2015
Active Caseload at beginning of period	0	4	2	6	5
Intake of New Appeals	9	5	9	7	53
Total Caseload	9	9	11	13	58
Total Matters Resolved	5	7	5	8	33
Active Caseload at end of period	4	2	6	5	25

While the Board has been case managing appeals since its inception in 2010, it was not until 2012/2013 fiscal year that the Board's first hearing was conducted. This year, the Board has experienced a significant increase in the number of appeals requested. A majority are a result of multiple requests for appeal from a single physician relating to a service(s) provided to multiple patients. This factor has led to a high number of Pre-Hearing Conferences conducted. Each new request for appeal results in one additional matter in the "Intake of new appeals" of the above table. Where a number of cases are discussed in a single telephone Pre-Hearing Conference, each of those cases counts as an individual and separate "Pre-Hearing Conferences conducted" as shown in the table below.

Caseload Summary	Apr 1, 2010 – Mar 31, 2011	Apr 1, 2011 – Mar 31, 2012	Apr 1, 2012 – Mar 31, 2013	Apr 1, 2013 – Mar 31, 2014	Apr 1, 2014 – Mar 31, 2015
Pre-Hearing Conferences Conducted	1	18	22	16	93
Motions Conducted	0	0	1	0	0
Hearings Conducted	0	0	1	0	0
Decisions Issued	0	0	1	1	0

Financial Performance

Description	Apr 1, 2010 – Mar 31, 2011	Apr 1, 2011 – Mar 31, 2012	Apr 1, 2012 – Mar 31, 2013	Apr 1, 2013 – Mar 31, 2014	Apr 1, 2014 – Mar 31, 2015
Per Diem Honouraria					
Attendance at Proceedings	0	0	5,459	3,638	0
Preparation for Proceedings	0	0	2,383	2,064	0
Decision Writing	0	0	982	982	0
Education, Administration & Travel	32,559	2,888	11,013	9,240	16,465
Other Expenses					
Court Reporting & Transcripts	0	0	731	1,738	0
Legal Services	25,681	4,320	26,334	15,092	34,900
Communications	434	1,868	6,566	1,724	4,006
Travel	2,295	0	1,679	515	2,315
TOTAL	\$60,969	\$9,076	\$55,147	\$34,993	\$57,686

PHYSICIAN PAYMENT REVIEW BOARD MEMBERSHIP AS OF MARCH 31, 2015

Physician Payment Review Board - Physician Members as of March 31, 2015				
Last Name	City	Occupation	Start Date	Expiry Date
Beaton, Melanie	London	Internal Med., Gastroenterology	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Bested, Alison	Toronto	Clinical Haematology	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Blunt, Marie Elizabeth	Sarnia	Obstetrics & Gynecology	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Bridgeo, David	Windsor	Family Physician	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Davidson, John	Kingston	Plastic Surgery	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Goldberg, Ronn	Thornhill	Diagnostic Radiology	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Gupta, Samir	Toronto	Dermatology	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Hector, Ian	Thornbury	Psychiatry	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Kao, Shawn	Etobicoke	Pediatric Medicine	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Lane, Robert	Newcastle	General Surgeon	18-Jul-12	17-Jul-17*
Lau, Helena	Oakville	Gastroenterology	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Male, Ross	Paris	Family Physician	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Mitchell, Marianna	Whitby	Pediatric Medicine	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Mohammad, Naveed	Mississauga	Emergency Medicine, Trauma	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Naassan, Anthony	Pickering	Hematology & Oncology	22-Oct-14	21-Oct-16
Nicolle, Michael	London	Neurom. & Electrod. Medicine	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Nijhawan, Navdeep	Richmond Hill	Ophthalmology	09-Jan-13	08-Jan-18*
O'Brien, Simon	Kingston	Psychiatry	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Rao, Vivek	Toronto	Cardiothoracic Surgery	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Smith, Kevin	Toronto	Anesthesiology	29-Aug-12	28-Aug-14
Waddell, James	Toronto	Orthopaedic Surgery	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Physician Payment Review Board - Public Members as of March 31, 2015				
Balitsky, Tammy	Toronto	Social Work	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Boltman, Marilyn	Toronto	Human Service Counseling	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Craig, Suzanne	Markham	Law	30-Apr-14	29-Apr-16
Egerton, Catherine	London	Financial Account Manager	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Ferguson, Nancy	Toronto	Law	09-Jan-13	08-Jan-18*

Forsythe, Wendy	Inverary	Adjudication	19-Nov-14	18-Nov-16
Goldstein, Sandra	Ottawa	Alternative Dispute Resolution	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*
Gumienny, Jacqueline	Kingston	Law	28-Apr-10	27-Apr-15*

*Where expiry dates are marked with *, member has been reappointed in accordance with ATAGAA waiver*

HEALTH BOARDS SECRETARIAT STAFF AS OF MARCH 31, 2015

Staff Member	Position
Sara van der Vliet	Registrar
Sandra Evora	Deputy Registrar
Anna Dunscombe	Executive Assistant / Researcher
Natalya Demyanenko	Case Management Coordinator
Alpha Aberra	Bilingual Case Officer
Maureen Baker	Case Officer
Margaret Bolinas	Case Officer
Sofiea Choudhary	Case Officer
Andrew Clifford	Case Officer
Kate Franklin	Case Officer
Glenn Sequeira	Case Officer
Shanti Persaud	Administrative Coordinator
Ann Ing	Administrative Assistant
Samantha Nero	Administrative Assistant
Mathanan Kailas	Senior Technology / Systems Administrator
Ketan Patel	Systems Analyst/Programmer
Aldeen Watin	Systems Analyst/Programmer