

RE: Statement From Minister Duguid

From: "Mather, Alex (MEDG)" <alex.mather@ontario.ca>
To: "McPhail, Blane (OPO)" <blane.mcphail@ontario.ca>, "Von Bargen, Alissa (MEDG)" <alissa.vonbargen@ontario.ca>, "Janmohamed, Tanvir (MEDG)" <tanvir.janmohamed@ontario.ca>
Cc: "Killorn, Bill (OPO)" <bill.killorn@ontario.ca>, "Forgione, Andrew (OPO)" <andrew.forgione@ontario.ca>, "Lazarus, Jordan (OPO)" <jordan.lazarus@ontario.ca>, "Beaudry, Jennifer (OPO)" <jennifer.beaudry2@ontario.ca>, "Moulton, Dan (ENERGY)" <dan.moulton@ontario.ca>, "Xavier, Katrina (ENERGY)" <katrina.xavier@ontario.ca>, "Campbell, David (ENERGY)" <david.campbell2@ontario.ca>
Date: Wed, 19 Oct 2016 14:17:08 -0400

Received. We'll prep to send.

From: McPhail, Blane (OPO)
Sent: October-19-16 2:16 PM
To: Von Bargen, Alissa (MEDG); Mather, Alex (MEDG); Janmohamed, Tanvir (MEDG)
Cc: Killorn, Bill (OPO); Forgione, Andrew (OPO); Lazarus, Jordan (OPO); Beaudry, Jennifer (OPO); Moulton, Dan (ENERGY); Xavier, Katrina (ENERGY); Campbell, David (ENERGY)
Subject: RE: Statement From Minister Duguid

Hey team,

Following up on Jordan's email from yesterday. Hoping the statement below can be sent to Gallery this afternoon.

Thanks

Blane

It's unfortunate that both opposition leaders continue to talk down Ontario and mislead Ontarians about residential energy costs in this province. The reality is that while there have been costs associated with taking our dirty, unreliable electricity system and making it clean and dependable, residents in Ottawa and Toronto are still paying less per month on average (\$161.52 and \$178.08 respectively) than their counterparts in large U.S. cities like New York (\$295.22), Boston (\$276.87) and Detroit (\$202.40).

(Source: Hydro Quebec, *Comparison of Electricity Prices in Major North American Cities*. All \$ in CAD.)

What's important about these comparisons is that even though they continue to burn dirty coal, our electricity rates are still cheaper. The good news is that Ontario is in this position even after doing the heavy lifting in terms of rebuilding aging infrastructure and transitioning off of coal. Thanks to our early leadership, Ontarians won't see the cost increases fossil fuel-dependent states like Michigan, New York, and Pennsylvania will. Ontarians are also healthier now because of cleaner air. with this year's Toronto Vital Signs report showing premature deaths and hospitalizations as a result of air pollution having dropped by 23% and 41% respectively since 2004.

We're also beating these states when it comes to economic growth and job creation. In fact, if you look at Real GDP Growth in 2015, Ontario (2.6%) grew faster than New York (1.4%), Pennsylvania (1.7%), and Michigan (1.4%). Ontario has also gained more jobs than both Michigan and Pennsylvania since the recessionary low in 2009, having created over 615,000 net new jobs. Ontario also continues to lead the country in Foreign Direct Investment.

(Source: Statistics Canada, U.S. Census Bureau, U.S. Bureau of Economic Analysis, U.S. Bureau of Labour Statistics and Ontario Ministry of Finance)

From: Lazarus, Jordan (OPO)
Sent: October-18-16 11:35 AM
To: 'Von Bargen, Alissa (MEDG)'; Mather, Alex (MEDG); Janmohamed, Tanvir (MEDG)
Cc: Forgione, Andrew (OPO); Killorn, Bill (OPO); Beaudry, Jennifer (OPO); Campbell, David (ENERGY); Xavier, Katrina (ENERGY); Moulton, Dan (ENERGY)
Subject: Statement From Minister Duguid

Hey Guys,

Hoping you could send the below email as a statement from Minister Duguid to the Gallery before question period ends. We will be doing this each day for the foreseeable future.

Proposed Email

Today in question period Patrick Brown once again made false claims about Ontario's energy sector and our economy. He once again talked down Ontario's business climate and encouraged businesses to set up shop in neighbouring U.S. jurisdictions even though just yesterday the Ontario Chamber of Commerce released a report where they said "the Red Tape Challenge and the Business Initiative Growth Initiative demonstrate government's commitment to reforms that will strengthen the competitiveness of Ontario's economy."

So let's once again look at the actual facts.

In 2015 Ontario's average industrial electricity prices (c/kWh) were \$8.35 in the South and \$6.35 in the North. These rates are lower than New York \$8.72, Pennsylvania \$9.59, Michigan \$9.13, and the U.S. industrial average \$8.71.

(Source: http://www.hydroquebec.com/publications/en/docs/comparaison-electricity-prices/comp_2016_en.pdf, Ontario Ministry of Energy, IESO)

Pricing Comparison

2015 Industrial Electricity Prices (Canadian ¢/kWh)							
Jurisdiction	Cost	Jurisdiction	Cost	Jurisdiction	Cost	Jurisdiction	Cost
1 Manitoba	4.67	17 Arkansas	7.49	33 Newfoundland	8.65	49 Nova Scotia	10.02
2 Quebec	5.17	18 Tennessee	7.53	34 U.S. Average	8.71	50 North Dakota	10.75
3 Washington	5.64	19 Alabama	7.58	35 New York	8.72	51 Florida	10.79
4 Alberta	5.87	20 South Carolina	7.68	36 Indiana	8.74	52 Delaware	10.96
5 Ontario - North	6.35	21 Utah	7.70	37 Ohio	8.75	53 Maryland	11.86
6 Oklahoma	6.64	22 Oregon	7.72	38 Wyoming	8.87	54 Maine	12.64
7 Montana	6.68	23 West Virginia	7.80	39 Minnesota	8.89	55 Vermont	13.14
8 Kentucky	6.80	24 Saskatchewan	7.81	40 Prince Edward Island	8.90	56 California	13.85
9 British Columbia	7.04	25 Nevada	7.83	41 Colorado	9.05	57 New Jersey	14.44
10 Iowa	7.06	26 Arizona	8.00	42 Michigan	9.13	58 New Hampshire	17.17
11 Louisiana	7.06	27 Idaho	8.05	43 Virginia	9.23	59 Massachusetts	17.56
12 Canadian Average	7.31	28 North Carolina	8.09	44 South Dakota	9.31	60 Connecticut	17.58
13 Missouri	7.32	29 New Mexico	8.09	45 Kansas	9.54	61 Alaska	18.85
14 Georgia	7.35	30 Illinois	8.24	46 Nebraska	9.56	62 Rhode Island	19.97
15 Texas	7.37	31 Ontario - South	8.35	47 Pennsylvania	9.59	63 Hawaii	31.10
16 New Brunswick	7.48	32 Mississippi	8.41	48 Wisconsin	9.87		

Note: Estimates may differ from actual costs to a consumer based on location, connection, and operational characteristics. Prices exclude taxes and participation in any applicable jurisdictional benefit programs.

The Ontario industrial price is based on the average all-in price for year-to-date May 2015, and includes the Hourly Ontario Energy Price, Class A Global Adjustment, delivery, wholesale market service charges and the Debt Retirement Charge. The 2 cent per kilowatt hour difference between northern Ontario and southern Ontario reflects the Northern Industrial Electricity Rate Program rebate.

All other Canadian prices (except Ontario) are from the Hydro Quebec Rate Comparison for rates effective April 1, 2015 for select local distribution companies servicing specific cities. Where Hydro Quebec reports prices for two cities in a province (e.g., Calgary and Edmonton), an average of the two is used; in provinces where only one city is reported (e.g., Vancouver in BC, Montreal in QC), that one price is used to represent the province for indicative comparison purposes. In the Hydro Quebec Rate Comparison, a large consumer reflects 5 MW with monthly consumption of 3,060 MWh.

American jurisdictions reflect year-to-date May 2015 data from the US Energy Information Administration's survey of approximately 500 of the largest electric utilities. The price reflects the average revenue reported by the electric utility from electricity sold to the industrial sector. The value represents an estimated average retail price, but does not necessarily reflect the price charged to an individual consumer. Prices are converted at an exchange rate of 1 USD = 1.30 CAD.

Even though these jurisdictions rely heavily on burning dirty coal we're beating them when it comes to industrial electricity prices and we're beating them when it comes to employment growth.

If you look at employment growth between these jurisdictions since 2009 Ontario has seen growth of 9.4%, with Michigan at 8.8%, Pennsylvania at 6.6% and New York at 2.4%.

(Source: Statistics Canada, U.S. Census Bureau, U.S. Bureau of Economic Analysis, U.S. Bureau of Labour Statistics and Ontario Ministry of Finance.)