

Hansard: Brown to Premier (Thibeault) (Murray) -- Cap and Trade

From: "Pichette, Marc (MOF)" <marc.pichette@ontario.ca>

To: "Bianchi, Angela (MOF)" <angela.bianchi@ontario.ca>, "Birks, Ryan (MOF)" <ryan.birks@ontario.ca>, "Bowie, Heather (MOF)" <heather.bowie@ontario.ca>, "Chiodi, Victoria (MOF)" <victoria.chiodi@ontario.ca>, "Clarke-Darshanand, Jamille (MOF)" <jamille.clarke-darshanand@ontario.ca>, "DeSouza, Jenarra (MOF)" <som1.jenarra.desouza@ontario.ca>, "Garcia-Wright, Agatha (MOF)" <agatha.garcia-wright@ontario.ca>, "Gobeil, Diana (MOF)" <diana.gobeil@ontario.ca>, "Harten, Jayne (MOF)" <jayne.harten@ontario.ca>, "Howe, Jyllian (MOF)" <jyllian.howe@ontario.ca>, "Ingram, Kelsey (MOF)" <kelsey.ingram@ontario.ca>, "Jackson, Kelly (MOF)" <kelly.jackson2@ontario.ca>, "Kelly, Maureen E. (MOF)" <maureen.e.kelly@ontario.ca>, "Kim, Minzi (MOF)" <minzi.kim@ontario.ca>, "Lone, Dianne (MOF)" <dianne.lone@ontario.ca>, "Martin, Jessica (MOF)" <jessica.martin@ontario.ca>, "Mendes, Elizabeth (MOF)" <elizabeth.mendes@ontario.ca>, "Mepstead, Tammy (MOF)" <tammy.mepstead@ontario.ca>, "Milana, Natale (MOF)" <natale.milana@ontario.ca>, "Morier, Rebecca (MOF)" <rebecca.morier@ontario.ca>, "Nolan, Natalie (MOF)" <natalie.nolan@ontario.ca>, "Patel, Lesley (MOF)" <lesley.patel@ontario.ca>, "Pearce, Christopher (MOF)" <christopher.pearce@ontario.ca>, "Spadoni, Peter (MOF)" <peter.spadoni@ontario.ca>, "Subrahmanyam, Sriram (MOF)" <sriram.subrahmanyam@ontario.ca>, "Thompson, Scott (MOF)" <scott.thompson@ontario.ca>, "Vo, Kim (MOF)" <kim.vo@ontario.ca>, "Weir, Mike (MOF)" <mike.weir@ontario.ca>, "Young, Gwendolynne (MOF)" <gwendolynne.young@ontario.ca>

Date: Thu, 09 Mar 2017 10:51:08 -0500

INSTANT HANSARD

>> **Patrick Brown:** Mr. Speaker, my question is for the **Premier**. While the Liberal government is in the mood of acknowledging their mistakes, I have a suggestion they can acknowledge another one. **That mistake would be the fact that this government refuses to make the cost of cap and trade visible on natural gas bills.** Mr. Speaker, will the **Premier** announce that miss tack is going to be corrected today?

>> **Premier Wynne:** Minister of energy.

>> **Minister Thibeault:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Once again I'm pleased to rise and acknowledge the work that this government is doing, Mr. Speaker, to address climate change, Mr. Speaker. The action of us doing nothing, Mr. Speaker, would have been catastrophic, Mr. Speaker, and that's why this government that acted, brought forward cap and trade, Mr. Speaker, and our climate change action plan. As the member well knows, the leader of the opposition well knows, Mr. Speaker, a decision to put the cap and trade onto the bills within, you know, natural gas, Mr. Speaker, **that was a decision that was made by the Ontario energy board, Mr. Speaker. They did consultation after consultation, Mr. Speaker. They've talked with the industry stakeholders and they said this was a cost of doing business, Mr. Speaker, and that cost, Mr. Speaker, will not be a part of the conversation as they move forward, Mr. Speaker. But this was an O.E.B. Decision,** Mr. Speaker.

>> **Patrick Brown:** Mr. Speaker, back to the **Premier**. The reason this Liberal government does not want to admit this mistake is they want to cover up and hide the fact this is a cash grab. 1.9 - Withdraw. The government is trying to hide this cash grab. \$1.9 billion a year to pander to voters, not to help the environment, not to make a real difference. If it was anything more than a cash grab, they'd be open and transparent about it. This is a **Premier** that promised she would be open and transparent. And this is the opposite of the -- this is the exact opposite. So my question, Mr. Speaker, directly to the

Premier, in the spirit of being open and transparent, will you do the right thing? Will you make sure that this cost is very visible and the government no longer hides it?

>> **Premier Wynne**: Minister of the environment and climate change.

>> **Minister Murray**: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I really enjoy the leader of the opposition. The man with no plan. He has no plan to reduce electricity by 25%. He won't support us. But he does have a plan, Mr. Speaker, on climate change. And we're so excited about it. He wants to introduce a carbon tax.

[Interjections] A carbon tax that wouldn't put 3 cents on natural gas but would put over 12. A carbon tax that wouldn't put 4 cents on propane. It would put 10 just like B.C. He would not not 4 cents on gasoline but 16 cents on gasoline.

>> **Patrick Brown**: Mr. Speaker, back to the **Premier**. Once again the Minister 's simply making it up. You know, this is a cash grab --

[Interjections] A cash grab and the government is trying to hide it. You know, Lorrie Goldstein pointed out, once Ontario joins the California and Québec cap and trade market next year, all bets are off. Of the permits were sold last month in terms of the latest auction. Mr. Speaker, how much money will taxpayers be on the hook for because of this disastrous cap and trade?

>> **Minister Murray**: Thank you. Mr. Speaker, let me finish because he keeps on telling us -- Mr. Speaker, the leader of the opposition keeps on telling us that he likes this B.C. Carbon tax model, which would add not 5 cents on diesel as our lower cost system would put. Almost 20 cents. And he says he would make Michigan the best leader ever had to use his words -- So to come anywhere near -- and those are numbers at 20 or 30 or 40, 50 under the federal government's cap, Mr. Speaker. That's the minimum amount, Mr. Speaker, that would be required. So if he wasn't using the B.C. Model which costs four times service the Ontario model.

N.B.: Transcripts are captured by a closed captioning system and may contain errors.